

Thinking through the Features of “Worthwhile Development”: A Dam Scenario

I am: World Bank representative. **You are:** Citizens of Koskovia.

The Republic of Koskovia is a poor country with a predominately agricultural economy. ¼ of population lives on <\$2.00/day. The World Bank has been approached by the GoK to provide funds and technical support for the construction of a mid-sized hydropower dam on the Stacizinha River.

Site 1 is on a branch of the river where the river’s rich resources support the livelihoods of a mid-sized (<50,000), non-indigenous fishing community. Damage to the eco-system of the river below the dam is expected to be substantial (though experts disagree on the extent of the damage). Locals and environmental advocates argue that the dam would almost entirely wipe-out the fisheries on which this community relies, though the flooding would be contained in a way that would not physically displace the villagers from their homes. They have not been offered relocation or compensation, though the government has not ruled out job-training programs for those who lose their livelihoods.

Site 2 overlaps the traditional homeland of a small (<10,000) indigenous community that relies almost exclusively on the nearby forest for its livelihood and spiritual meaning and whose language is threatened by the community’s dwindling numbers. Damming this part of the river will flood a large portion of the group’s historic homeland and require the physical relocation of half to two-thirds of the population. It will not destroy the forest on which the remaining members rely. The displaced will be relocated to another forested area to the East and given job training and shelter. [*physical displacement*]

The World Bank is conducting its stakeholder analysis and has organized workshops with *at least* four key stakeholder groups:

1. The indigenous community (affected by Site 2)
2. The non-indigenous fishing community (affected by Site 1)
3. Several mid-level officials from the central government, including representatives of the Ministries of Agriculture, of Labor, and of Energy.
4. Representatives of the two main mining companies.
5. Indigenous elite
6. Municipal elected officials and residents from the Capital City

The World Bank would like to ask each group to deliberate independently, and then share their recommendations to the Bank representatives before deliberating with each other to try to arrive at a mutually agreeable solution. Options include:

1. Build the dam on Site 1 (with any other policy recommendations)
2. Build the dam on Site 2 (with any other policy recommendations)
3. Do not build the dam (with any other policy recommendations)
4. Other?